



## Rats And Loan Grading Systems

by [Steve Brown](#) Topics: [lending](#), [risk management](#), [business customers](#)

**Summary:** When community banks evaluate commercial loan risk exposure, a key element is loan grade. Yet, not all banks have a uniform loan grading system. We present some interesting findings from an FDIC examination.

It has long been known that cats eat rats. But, a new study finds that is not the case in New York City. It seems these rats are bigger, so scientists found the cats were scared of them and were instead seeking prey that would not fight back. Strange!

Bankers that grade loans have occasionally been known to mutter "rats" too, probably because this activity has so many intricacies. When community banks evaluate commercial loan risk exposure, a key element is how each loan is graded. But, you may be surprised to hear that banks don't necessarily have a uniform loan grading system.

[An FDIC examination](#) of commercial loan risk grading systems at a cross-section of banks found wide disparities, not just between banks but within individual banks. The FDIC found examples of similar loans at a particular bank getting very different grades, depending on who did the grading. In some cases, loans that appeared to carry lower risks got poor grades, while higher-risk loans got better grades.

Accurately measuring loan loss risk has always been important in forecasting future losses and set asides. This process is even more important with the new Current Expected Credit Loss rules (CECL) that require banks to calculate future loss potential at the point of making a loan and to make appropriate set asides.

While large banks often have sophisticated solutions to help analyze loan data and inform grades, community banks often have a more straightforward process, using in-house experts to determine grades based on an understanding of regulatory requirements and the borrower. The FDIC says one system is not necessarily better than the other, although the additional data offered by quantitative methods can be helpful.

For community banks that rely on expert judgement, the problem is setting up a consistent grading system so that those making the judgements have clear guidance. Often grades and criteria are not clearly or adequately defined, leading to more discretion and potentially errant grades.

The FDIC offered examples of real loans at real banks to show how questionable grades can occur. In one example, a bank had two apartment building loans with similar loan to value ratios and repayment histories. But, the loan with more cash flow was assigned a lower grade than the loan with less cash flow. This bank allowed relationship managers to set the grades and did not have sufficiently clear guidance or standards. The result: grades that appeared to be skewed.

The FDIC review includes more examples of problems that can help banks evaluate their own grading systems. Several of the banks in the review had grading systems that were overly broad and risk categories that were not well defined. This led to inconsistent and at times incorrect grades, which could lead to other problems like strategic errors and unexpected losses.

Commercial loan grading is an important function in risk management, of course. At times, it is necessary to review, refresh and revise. With CECL coming, now more than ever, may be the time to review and possibly tighten policies and procedures. For additional guidance, check out the [FDIC's Statement on the Allowance for Loan and Lease Losses](#).

# ECONOMY & RATES

Rates As Of: 10/15/2018 12:55PM (PDT)

Treasury	Yields	MTD Chg	YTD Chg
3M	2.27	0.08	0.90
6M	2.46	0.09	0.93
1Y	2.65	0.09	0.92
2Y	2.85	0.03	0.97
5Y	3.01	0.06	0.81
10Y	3.16	0.10	0.75
30Y	3.34	0.13	0.60
FF Market	FF Target	Fed Disc	
2.18	2.25	2.75	
SOFR	Prime	Unemp	
2.18	5.25	3.70	

[More Market Rates](#)

## BANK NEWS

### M&A Activity

1) First Interstate Bank (\$12.2B, MT) will acquire Idaho Independent Bank (\$725mm, ID) and Community 1st Bank (\$130mm, ID) in separate transactions. First Interstate will pay about \$181.3mm in cash (3%) and stock (97%) for Idaho Independent or about 2.49x tangible book. First Interstate will pay about \$21.5mm in cash (3%) and stock (97%) for Community 1st or about 1.55x tangible book.

### Biz Applications

FDIC research finds only 23% of large banks (>\$10B) and 11% of community banks (<\$10B) accept small business applications online. Meanwhile, both large and small banks accept applications at the branch (96% and 97%, respectively), telephone call by bank staff (69%, 51%), or an onsite visit by bank staff (83%, 49%). Lastly, only community banks take applications from brokers (4% vs. 0% for large banks).

### Fraud

[Bankrate's former CFO, DiMaria, was sentenced](#) to 10Ys in prison for securities and accounting fraud. He was also ordered to pay \$21.2mm in restitution to Bankrate's shareholders.

## LOAN SERVICES FOR COMMUNITY BANKS

PCBB is almost entirely owned by community banks and it does not compete for your business. Contact us to do [loan participations](#) as you protect your customer relationships.

Copyright 2018 PCBB. Information contained herein is based on sources we believe to be reliable, but its accuracy is not guaranteed. Customers should rely on their own outside counsel or accounting firm to address specific circumstances. This document cannot be reproduced or redistributed outside of your institution without the written consent of PCBB.