

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

**PANTIES PLUS, INC.,**  
Petitioner,

v.

**BRAGEL INTERNATIONAL, INC.,**  
Patent Owner

---

Case No. **IPR2017-00044**  
Patent No. **7,144,296**

---

**PATENT OWNER'S OBJECTIONS TO EVIDENCE FILED APRIL 19, 2017**

Patent Owner hereby files the following objections to Exhibits 3001 and 3002, filed by the Board on April 19, 2017, pursuant to 37 C.F.R. §42.64.

**Exhibit 3001:** Patent Owner objects to Exhibit 3001 as irrelevant (FRE 401-403). Patent Owner respectfully submits that Exhibit 3001, which reflects the Federal Circuit's remand to the District Court in the two related litigation matters (Case No. 8:15-cv-01756-R-FFM and Case No. 2:15-cv-08364-R-FFM), does not address the merits of the District Court's findings of fact and conclusions of law, other than to hold that those findings of fact and conclusions of law were not sufficiently detailed to allow an appellate review of the grant of a preliminary injunction. *See* Ex. 3001 at 4-5.

**Exhibit 3002:** Patent owner objects to Exhibit 3002 as irrelevant (FRE 401-403). Patent Owner respectfully submits that Exhibit 3002 is a Federal Circuit decision relating to a distinct case, and is not relevant evidence to this matter.

DATED: April 26, 2017

Respectfully submitted,  
LEWIS ROCA ROTHGERBER CHRISTIE LLP

By /Thomas J. Daly/  
Thomas J. Daly  
Reg. No. 32,213

Lead Counsel for Petitioner  
Brangel International, Inc.

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on April 26, 2017, a copy of this PATENT OWNER'S OBJECTIONS TO EVIDENCE FILED APRIL 19, 2017, was served via email on the following correspondence address of record for Petitioner, pursuant to 37 C.F.R. § 42.6(e):

**LEAD COUNSEL**

Sergey Kolmykov (Reg. No. 47,713)  
Kroub, Silbersher & Kolmykov PLLC  
305 Broadway 7th Fl.  
New York, NY 10007  
Tel: (212) 323-7442  
Email: skolmykov@kskiplaw.com  
info@kskiplaw.com

**BACK-UP COUNSEL**

Gaston Kroub (Reg. No. 51,903)  
Kroub, Silbersher & Kolmykov PLLC  
305 Broadway 7th Fl.  
New York, NY 10007  
Tel: (212) 323-7442  
Email: gkroub@kskiplaw.com

/Thomas J. Daly/  
Thomas J. Daly  
Registration No. 32,213  
*Counsel for Patent Owner Bragel  
International, Inc.*