Case 3:07-cv-03206-MLC-DEA Document 233-25 Filed 09/08/08 Page 1 of 8 PageID: 10827

EXHIBIT V



3M Company Exhibit 1056 3M Company, Merck & Co., Inc., and Merck Sharp & Dohme Corp., v. AptarFrance S.A.S. IPR2018-01055 Page 1 of 8

Case 3:07-cv-03206-MLC-DEA Document 233-25 Filed 09/08/08 Page 2 of 8 PageID: 10828

US District Court - New Jersey Novo v. Sanofi-Aventis FINAL - October 25, 2007 Charles E. Clemens

	Pa
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY	
NOVO NORDISK A/S,	
Plaintiff,	
ν.	
SANOFI-AVENTIS U.S. LLC AND	
SANOFI-AVENTIS,	
Defendants.	
No. 3:07-cv-03206-MLC-JJH	
VIDEO DEPOSITION	
Charles E. Clemens	
October 25, 2007	
New York, New York	
Lead: James M. McCarthy, Esquire	
Firm: McDonnell Boehnen	
FINAL COPY	
JANE ROSE REPORTING 1-800-825-3341	

FINAL - October 25, 2007 Charles E. Clemens

Pag	e 2
ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF Marc De Leeuw, Esquire James T. Williams, Esquire SULLIVAN & CROMWELL 125 Broad Street New York, N.Y. 10004-2498 PHONE: 212.558.4219	
- and - Robert J. Lack, Esquire Jennifer H. Chin, Esquire FRIEDMAN KAPLAN SEILER & ADELMAN LLP 1633 Broadway New York, NY 10019-6708 PHONE: 212.833.1133	
ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANTS	
James M. McCarthy, Esquire Sean M. Sullivan, Esquire McDONNELL BOEHNEN HULBERT & BERGHOFF LLP 300 South Wacker Drive Chicago, Illinois 60606-6709 PHONE: 312.935.2359	

FINAL - October 25, 2007 Charles E. Clemens

	Page 98
¹ disclosed in the '278 pater	it about how to
2 connect the tubular part to	o the nut?
3 A. I am pretty sure I ans	wered it
4 already, but, no, not really. I	don't think the
5 specification goes into other	embodiments in
6 that area.	
7 Q. By saying no, not re	eally, what you are
8 saying is there might be of	ther ways that that
⁹ can be solved, it is just no	t shown in the '278
¹⁰ patent?	
11 A. Yes.	
12Q. How else would an	engineer connect or
¹³ one of ordinary skill in the	art I'll
¹⁴ rephrase.	
¹⁵ How else would an e	ngineer or one of
¹⁶ ordinary skill in the art cor	nnect the tubular
¹⁷ part to the nut?	
18 A. You are asking me from	om an engineering
¹⁹ standpoint what might be so	me other approaches
20 that	
21 Q. That's my understa	nding what you meant
22 by	
A. That would have take	
24 this timeframe? So general	
25 happening in this device is w	ve are rotating a

FINAL - October 25, 2007 Charles E. Clemens

		Page 99
1	part in one instance and then trying to	
2	translate kind of linear motion through that	
3	coupling, whatever that connection means is,	
4	back down into, you know, a plunger.	
5	So there may be at least a few more	
6	approaches that you might take to translate, you	
7	know, linear to rotational to linear or	
8	rotational to linear motion.	
9	You can do that through gearing, you	
10	can do that through threads, I mean, these are,	
11	you know, basic, typically basic machines that	
12	mechanical engineers use to do this kind of	
13	thing.	
14	Q. So so far what I have heard you say	
15	is and correct me if this is wrong, please	
16	but the ways that you can connect the tubular	
17	part to the nut are a gearbox, which is shown in	
18	the '278 patent, or gearing or threads.	
19	Are there any other ways?	
20	A. Well, I mean, yes, there are other	
21	ways of converting rotational motion into linear	
22	motion. You might use cams with springs. You	
23	might you know, so all I'm saying is is	
24	that and typically what is done in these	
25	instances of design is that you know you have	

FINAL - October 25, 2007 Charles E. Clemens

1			
			Page 100
	1	a particular motion or event or change in	
	2	relationship of parts, you know, you have to	
	3	achieve that in some way and there is almost	
	4	always several approaches to that.	
	5	What I have described, gears, threads,	
	6	cams, I mean, you could even well, there are	
	7	other ways of translating rotational and linear	
	8	motion. They may not be optimum for this	
	9	particular design, but all I am saying is that	
	10	engineers take these basic mechanisms and they	
	11	apply it to whatever the product or whatever	
	12	they are trying to achieve in a product.	
	13	Q. The basic mechanism that's shown in	
	14	the '278 patent is the gearbox, correct?	
	15	A. Correct.	
	16	Q. Earlier you also mentioned that I	
	17	think we were interrupting each other and you	
	18	mentioned that gearing in general is shown in	
	19	the '278 patent.	
	20	Can you tell me where gearing is	
	21	described in the '278 patent as a way to connect	
	22	the tubular part to the nut?	
	23	A. All the description in the	
	24	specification let me I'm going to just ask	
	25	a clarification question back to you.	

FINAL - October 25, 2007 Charles E. Clemens

4			
			Page 101
	1	Are you, by that question, making a	
	2	distinction between the gearbox separate and	
	3	other kinds of gearing or just in general?	
	4	Because the specification relates to gearing in	
	5	several areas.	
	6	Q. I'm just trying to get to the bottom	
	7	of your opinion, Mr. Clemens, which I believe	
	8	when I asked how the tubular part could be	
	9	connected to the nut and what was shown about	
	10	that connection in the '278 patent, I believe	
	11	that your answer was both the gearbox, and then	
	12	l believe you also said gearing.	
	13	So I am wondering if you are making a	
	14	distinction, actually, between gearbox and	
	15	gearing?	
	16	A. Well, what I meant by that is there is	
	17	lots of different ways of doing gearing. You	
	18	might try a rack and pinion which this describes	
	19	or you might try more direct gearing, or you	
	20	might try a worm gear on a thread.	
	21	Q. Is rack and opinion the type of	
	22	gearing that's shown in the '278 patent?	
	23	A. Yes, in figure 1 and 2.	
	24	Q. Is direct gearing or worm gear on a	
	25	thread described in the '278 patent as a way to	

.

FINAL - October 25, 2007 Charles E. Clemens

	Page 102
¹ connect the tubular part to the nut?	
2 A. No, not really. I would say rack a	nd
³ pinion is probably a better characterization	on.
4 Q. What is gearing?	
5 A. Well, you know what a gear is? Y	′ou
6 want me to describe a gear?	
7 Q. Pretend I am a layperson and y	ou want
⁸ to describe what gearing is.	
9 MR. DE LEEUW: Does he have to	2
10 pretend?	
A. Well, actually gears can take lots	of
12 different shapes, but in general, and very	1
13 quickly, usually a round disk-shaped eler	nent
14 that has teeth of some shape and the tee	eth are
15 of a certain number and generally you ha	ave more
16 than one that are interacting. The teeth a	are
¹⁷ interacting with one another as they are	
18 turning, and you are transmitting force in	
19 motion through them. That's kind of a qu	lick
20 description.	
21 Q. Is gearing the same as a gear of	or a
22 gear wheel?	
23 A. Sure.	
24 Q. Those are interchangeable term	ns?
25 A. Well, they are specific to whateve	r