

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

3M COMPANY, MERCK & CO., INC., and
MERCK SHARP & DOHME CORP.,
Petitioner,

v.

APTAR FRANCE SAS,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2018-01055
Patent 9,370,631 B2

**PATENT OWNER’S MOTION FOR *PRO HAC VICE* ADMISSION OF
BENJAMIN G. MURRAY UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 41.10(c)**

Mail Stop “PATENT BOARD”
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

Aptar France SAS and AptarGroup, Inc. (collectively, “Patent Owner”) hereby submits this motion, respectfully requesting that the Board recognize Benjamin G. Murray, Esq., as counsel *pro hac vice* during this proceeding.

I. BACKGROUND

Patent Owner’s Motion for *Pro Hac Vice* Admission is being filed in compliance with and pursuant to the “Order—Authorizing Motion for Pro Hac Vice Admission” in Case No. IPR2013-00639 (MPT) [“the Order”].

II. STATEMENT OF FACTS

As required by the Order, the following statement of facts shows that there is good cause for the Board to recognize Mr. Murray *pro hac vice*.

Mr. Murray is an experienced litigation attorney and has been involved in numerous complex litigations in state and federal courts. Mr. Murray biography is attached hereto as Exhibit 2015.

Mr. Murray has reviewed U.S. Patent No. 9,370,631 and the petition, already filed in this proceeding, and is familiar with the subject matter at issue in this proceeding.

Therefore, Patent Owner respectfully submits that there is good cause for the Board to recognize Mr. Murray as counsel *pro hac vice* during this proceeding.

III. AFFIDAVIT OR DECLARATION OF INDIVIDUAL SEEKING TO APPEAR

Patent Owner's Motion for *Pro Hac Vice* Admission is accompanied by the Declaration of Benjamin G. Murray, filed as Exhibit 2014, as required by the Order.

Respectfully submitted,

Patent Owner

Dated: February 13, 2019

By: /s/ Ashley N. Moore

Ashley N. Moore, Reg. No. 51.667

amoore@mckoolsmith.com

McKOOL SMITH, P.C.

300 Crescent Court Suite 1500

Dallas, TX 75201

Telephone: (214) 978-4000

Telecopier: (214) 978-4044

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE (37 C.F.R. § 42.6(e))

The undersigned hereby certifies that the foregoing Patent Owner's Motion for Admission *Pro Hac Vice* of Benjamin G. Murray and Exhibits 2014 and 2015 were served electronically via e-mail on February 13, 2019, on the following counsel of record for Petitioners:

Steven D. Maslowski
AKIN GUMP STRAUSS HAUER & FELD LLP
Gregory A. Morris
Ron N. Sklar (to be admitted *pro hac vice*)
HONIGMAN MILLER SCHWARTZ AND COHN LLP
Rubén H. Muñoz
Jason Weil
Caitlin Olwell
AKIN GUMP STRAUSS HAUER & FELD LLP
AG-3M-APTARIPR@akingump.com

Dated: February 13, 2019

By: /s/ Ashley N. Moore

Ashley N. Moore, Reg. No. 51.667
amoore@mckoolsmith.com
McKOOL SMITH, P.C.
300 Crescent Court Suite 1500
Dallas, TX 75201
Telephone: (214) 978-4000
Telecopier: (214) 978-4044