

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

3M COMPANY, MERCK & CO., INC., and
MERCK SHARP & DOHME CORP.,
Petitioner,

v.

APTARFRANCE SAS,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2018-01055
Patent 9,370,631 B2

**PATENT OWNER’S MOTION FOR *PRO HAC VICE* ADMISSION OF
RYAN A. HARGRAVE UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 41.10(c)**

Mail Stop “PATENT BOARD”
Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

Aptar France SAS and AptarGroup, Inc. (collectively, “Patent Owner”) respectfully requests that the Board recognize Ryan A. Hargrave, Esq., as counsel *pro hac vice* during this proceeding.

I. BACKGROUND

Patent Owner’s Motion for *Pro Hac Vice* Admission is being filed in compliance with and pursuant to the “Order—Authorizing Motion for Pro Hac Vice Admission” in Case No. IPR2013-00639 (MPT) [“the Order”].

II. STATEMENT OF FACTS

As required by the Order, the following statement of facts shows that there is good cause for the Board to recognize Ms. Hargrave *pro hac vice*.

Ms. Hargrave is an experienced litigation attorney and has been involved in numerous complex litigations in state and federal courts. Ms. Hargrave biography is attached hereto as Exhibit 2002.

Ms. Hargrave has reviewed U.S. Patent No. 9,370,631, and the petition already filed in this proceeding. Further, Ms. Hargrave is counsel of record in the co-pending litigation between the parties entitled *AptarGroup, Inc. et. al. v. 3M Company et al.*, before the U.S. District Court for the Northern District of Illinois, Case No. 1:17-cv-06294-VMK; and, as such, is familiar with the subject matter at issue in this proceeding.

Therefore, Patent Owner respectfully submits that there is good cause for the Board to recognize Ms. Hargrave as counsel *pro hac vice* during this proceeding.

III. AFFIDAVIT OR DECLARATION OF INDIVIDUAL SEEKING TO APPEAR

Patent Owner's Motion for *Pro Hac Vice* Admission is accompanied by the Affidavit of Ryan A. Hargrave, filed as Exhibit 2001, as required by the Order.

Respectfully submitted,

Patent Owner

Dated: June 1, 2018

By: /s/ Ashley N. Moore

Ashley N. Moore, Reg. No. 51.667

amoore@mckoolsmith.com

McKOOL SMITH, P.C.

300 Crescent Court Suite 1500

Dallas, TX 75201

Telephone: (214) 978-4000

Telecopier: (214) 978-4044

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE (37 C.F.R. § 42.6(e))

The undersigned hereby certifies that the foregoing **PATENT OWNER'S MOTION FOR ADMISSION *PRO HAC VICE* OF RYAN A. HARGRAVE and EXHIBITS 2001 AND 2002** were served electronically via e-mail on June 1, 2018, on the following counsel of record for Petitioners:

Steven D. Maslowski
AKIN GUMP STRAUSS HAUER & FELD LLP
Gregory A. Morris
Ron N. Sklar (to be admitted *pro hac vice*)
HONIGMAN MILLER SCHWARTZ AND COHN LLP
Rubén H. Muñoz
Jason Weil
Caitlin Olwell
AKIN GUMP STRAUSS HAUER & FELD LLP
AG-3M-APTARIPR@akingump.com

Dated: June 1, 2018

By: /s/ Ashley N. Moore

Ashley N. Moore, Reg. No. 51.667
amoore@mckoolsmith.com
McKOOL SMITH, P.C.
300 Crescent Court Suite 1500
Dallas, TX 75201
Telephone: (214) 978-4000
Telecopier: (214) 978-4044