

**From:** [McKeever, Patrick J. \(SDO\)](#)  
**To:** [Director PTABDecision Review](#)  
**Cc:** [\\*Tessar-ptab](#); [St. John-Larkin, David \(DEN\)](#); [\\*Hester-ptab](#); [\\*bervik-ptab](#); [\\*Entropic-DISH](#); [Jason.Engel.PTAB@klgates.com](#); [Katy.Allor@klgates.com](#); [Samuel.Richey@klgates.com](#); [Brian.Bozzo@klgates.com](#)  
**Subject:** DISH Network Corp. et al. v. Entropic Communications, LLC, IPR2023-00392 - Request for Director Review  
**Date:** Monday, September 11, 2023 7:10:16 PM  
**Attachments:** [Request for Director Review 715 IPR2023-00392.pdf](#)

---

**CAUTION:** This email has originated from a source outside of USPTO. **PLEASE CONSIDER THE SOURCE** before responding, clicking on links, or opening attachments.

Dear Director Vidal:

Pursuant to the Revised Interim Director Review Process, I write on behalf of Petitioners DISH Network Corporation, DISH Network L.L.C., and Dish Network Service L.L.C. (collectively, "DISH") to respectfully notify the Director of the attached Request for Director Review of the Board's Decision Denying Institution of *Inter Partes* Review filed today by Petitioners in Case No. IPR2023-00392. Paper 10 ("Request").

As discussed in the Request, the Board abused its discretion by ignoring the Carnero prior art's express disclosures of **remotely controlling** channel selection and Dr. Schonfeld's unrebutted expert testimony concerning those disclosures. The Board's failure to consider this evidence led it to its erroneous conclusion that the proposed combination of Fisk and Carnero does not render obvious the challenged claims of the '715 patent.

Petitioners appreciate the Director's consideration of their Request.

Respectfully submitted,

*/Patrick J. McKeever/*

Counsel for Petitioners DISH Network Corporation, DISH Network L.L.C., and Dish Network Service L.L.C.

**Patrick McKeever | Perkins Coie LLP**

**PARTNER**  
11452 El Camino Real, Suite 300  
San Diego, CA 92130-2080  
D. +1.858.720.5722  
E. [PMcKeever@perkinscoie.com](mailto:PMcKeever@perkinscoie.com)

---

NOTICE: This communication may contain privileged or other confidential information. If you have received it in error, please advise the sender by reply email and immediately delete the message and any attachments without copying or disclosing the contents. Thank you.

IPR2023-00392  
Ex. 3100